



University of London  
**BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

Monday, 10 October 2011  
4.00 pm  
Room G35, Senate House

## MINUTES

### PRESENT

Dame Jenny Abramsky (Chair)	His Honour Judge Grainger
Mr David Beever	Mr Edward Hartill
Mr Abdul Bhanji	Mr Maxwell Hutchinson
Professor Geoffrey Crossick*	Professor Peter Kopelman
Mr Steven Fogel	Professor David Latchman <sup>+</sup>
Professor Jonathan Freeman-Attwood	Mrs Suzanne McCarthy
	Professor Sir Richard Trainor

### APOLOGIES

Ms Emma Burns

### IN ATTENDANCE

Mr Martin Burchett	Miss Damaris Currie
Mr Chris Cobb	Mr Kim Frost
Mr Richard Cryer	Miss Rosalind Sector

\* present except for BTMM 1363-72

<sup>+</sup> present except for BTMM 1388-90

### Functions, Constitution and Membership

1357 The Board noted its Functions, Constitution and Membership for 2011-12, set out in Document BT390.

### Minutes of the Meeting Held on 13 July 2011

1358 The Board confirmed the minutes of the meeting held on 13 July 2011.

### Matters Arising

1359 All matters arising from previous meetings of the Board were covered elsewhere on the agenda.

### Vice-Chancellor's Report

1360 The Vice-Chancellor introduced his report (BT391, Confidential), drawing attention, in particular, to developments in respect of the University Marine Biological Station. Members welcomed the news that discussions were taking

place with the University of St Andrews with a view to a joint venture being established to operate the Station. Members were updated also on the latest news regarding fundraising for the proposed redevelopment of the Station.

- 1361 Members noted Appendix BT391A detailing activity at the Centre for Creative Collaboration in July and August 2011, and the list of the Vice-Chancellor's main activities and meetings undertaken since 13 July 2011 (Appendix BT391B), also attached to the report.

### **Appointment of the Vice-Chancellor**

- 1362 The Vice-Chancellor left the room for the duration of this item.
- 1363 The Chair introduced the item by expressing her regret that Professor Crossick had decided to stand down from the post of Vice-Chancellor at the end of the 2011-12 session.
- 1364 The Chair reported that both the Collegiate Council, at its meeting on 30 September 2011, and members of the Board at an informal meeting held on 3 October 2011, had discussed how matters should be taken forward in the light of Professor Crossick's announcement. One of the key matters for consideration was the need for a review of the post of the Vice-Chancellor. Members were advised that, in March 2007, the, then, University Council, as part of its deliberations on the new Statutes and governance structure, had agreed that there should be a review of the new structure and a review of the post of the Vice-Chancellor, after the governance arrangements had been in place for three years. These reviews were to be conducted jointly by the Board of Trustees and the Collegiate Council. Subsequently, in November 2008, when discussing the appointment process for Sir Graeme Davies' successor, the Board had agreed that, as the appointee would have been in post for only one year before the two reviews commenced, they should be delayed until the academic year 2012-13.
- 1365 The Board was informed that, at its meeting on 30 September 2011, the Collegiate Council had agreed that the joint review of the post of the Vice-Chancellor should be brought forward to precede the appointment process for Professor Crossick's successor. This proposal had been supported by members present at the informal meeting on 3 October 2011. To that end, it was proposed that the review should report to the Collegiate Council's meeting on 9 December 2011, and then to an extraordinary meeting of the Board to be arranged for the week beginning 12 December 2011.
- 1366 The Chair reported that matters to be considered by the review would include whether there should be a post of Vice-Chancellor and, if so, whether the post should be full-time or part-time, and the extent to which any of the duties of the role could be delegated. The detailed terms of reference would be agreed by the review group.
- 1367 The Board noted that, in the absence of the Deputy Vice-Chancellor, who was on research leave until the end of December 2011, the Chief Operating Officer and University Secretary, Mr Chris Cobb, had been asked by the Collegiate

Council to consult with its members regarding membership and terms of reference for the joint review. The Collegiate Council had agreed that the group taking forward the joint review should have a broad-based membership, representative of the various constituencies. Mr Cobb advised the Board that a number of members of the Collegiate Council had expressed an interest in serving on the joint review. Should the Board agree that the review group be established, it was proposed that it would include five members from the Collegiate Council, drawn from a range of Colleges of different sizes, type and location.

1368 The Board agreed that a joint review of the post of Vice-Chancellor should be taken forward as proposed, prior to the appointment process for Professor Crossick's successor. It was suggested that five independent members of the Board should serve on the review group alongside the five Collegiate Council members. Following discussion, the following were identified to serve on the group:

- (i) Dame Jenny Abramsky (Chair);
- (ii) Mr David Beever;
- (iii) Mr Abdul Bhanji;
- (iv) Mr Steven Fogel; and
- (v) Mrs Suzanne McCarthy.

1369 It was noted that both the Board and the Collegiate Council would have an opportunity for their own discussions on the post of Vice-Chancellor at their November 2011 meetings. The outcomes of these discussions would be submitted to the joint review.

1370 Members agreed that, in taking forward the review of the post of Vice-Chancellor, it would be important to ascertain whether there were any lessons that could be learnt from the previous appointment process. It was noted that the views of Professor Crossick and of his predecessor, Sir Graeme Davies, on the post of Vice-Chancellor, would be sought.

1371 In response to a query about the urgency of the review process, it was noted that, if a successor was to be in post on 1 August 2012, an advertisement for the post would need to be placed as soon as possible. It was further noted that the process for the appointment of a Vice-Chancellor was set out in Ordinance 13, which specified that this process should be conducted by a joint committee of the Board and the Collegiate Council which would bring a recommendation to the Board.

1372 **AGREED**

- (i) That, in line with the University Council resolution of March 2007, a review of the post of Vice-Chancellor, to be undertaken jointly by the Board and the Collegiate Council, should be progressed forthwith.

- (ii) That the joint review should report to the Collegiate Council's meeting on 9 December 2011, and then to an extraordinary meeting of the Board to be arranged for the week beginning 12 December 2011<sup>1</sup>.
- (iii) That the following members of the Board should serve on the joint review group:
  - Dame Jenny Abramsky (Chair)
  - Mr David Beever
  - Mr Abdul Bhanji
  - Mr Steven Fogel
  - Mrs Suzanne McCarthy
- (iv) That a discussion on the post of the Vice-Chancellor should take place at the Board's meeting on 21 November 2011.
- (v) That, subject to the outcome of the review, the appointment process for the successor to the current Vice-Chancellor should commence following the joint review of the post.

## **Warburg Institute**

*BTMM 1373-75 are considered exempt from disclosure in accordance with Part II of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.*

## **Human Resources Strategy 2011-13**

1376 The Director of Human Resources (HR) introduced a report (BT393) setting out the proposed HR Strategy for 2011-13 (Appendix BT393A). The Director of HR had liaised with Ms Emma Burns in developing the Strategy, and work on a separate Action Plan and Key Performance Indicators was underway. It was suggested that consideration should be given to including reference to staff appraisal within the Strategy, and the Director of HR confirmed that he would consider this further, although it was noted that appraisal would be covered within the Action Plan. The Director of HR anticipated that all staff would have participated in the new competency-based appraisal process by the end of the session.

### **1377 AGREED**

To approve the HR Strategy for 2011-13.

## **Finance Report**

1378 The Board received a report (BT394, Confidential) incorporating the income and expenditure summary by Department for the 12 months to 31 July 2011 (Appendix BT394A, Confidential).

---

<sup>1</sup> Post meeting note: the extraordinary meeting of the Board was subsequently arranged to take place at 8.00 am on 15 December 2011.

1379 The Director of Finance and Estates reported that the external audit of the University's accounts for 2010-11 was in progress and that, to date, no material concerns had been raised by the external auditor, Deloitte LLP. He drew attention to paragraph 5 of the report which indicated that, on a recurrent basis, the operating result for 2010-11 demonstrated a significant improvement of £1,096k on the 2009-10 surplus. The operating result for 2010-11 also compared favourably with the previous year's as a percentage of income: representing 2.7% of income in 2010-11, compared with 1.8% for 2009-10. The Director of Finance and Estates highlighted the information on efficiency savings at paragraphs 6 and 7 of the report, and the five-year summary of operating results at page 7. Members were informed that a full commentary on the 2010-11 income and expenditure account would be presented to the Board at its meeting on 21 November 2011 with the Annual Report and Financial Statements for 2010-11.

### **Redevelopment and Expansion of Student Accommodation**

*BTMM 1381-86 are considered exempt from disclosure in accordance with Part II of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.*

1380 The Director of Finance and Estates presented a report on the redevelopment and expansion of student accommodation (BT395, Confidential).

### **Senate House North Block**

*BTMM 1387-90 are considered exempt from disclosure in accordance with Part II of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.*

### **Safety Committee Annual Report 2010-11**

1391 The Board considered, and was content with, the Safety Committee Annual Report covering the 2010-11 session (BT397). Additional supporting information was available on the Table.

### **Review of Effectiveness for 2010-11**

1392 The Board considered a report on the results of the annual reviews of the effectiveness of the Board of Trustees and the Collegiate Council for 2010-11 (BT398). The results of the reviews of effectiveness for the Board and the Collegiate Council were attached to the report as Appendices BT398A and BT398B respectively.

### **Strategic Discussions and Visits to Colleges**

1393 Document BT399 invited the Board to consider the subjects for strategic discussions for 2011-12 and the nature of future visits to Colleges. Members considered the list of possible topics for strategic discussions and agreed that the following should be taken forward during 2011-12:

- (i) The University of London brand;

- (ii) shared services (including the strategy for student services); and
  - (iii) Senate House Libraries.
- 1394 It was further agreed that a strategic discussion on the School of Advanced Study (SAS) would be apposite in 2012-13, once the Higher Education Funding Council for England (HEFCE) review of the School had concluded.
- 1395 In respect of the proposed discussion on the University of London brand, it was noted that several Colleges had undertaken research into the value of the brand and might be willing to share this information with the University.
- 1396 On the subject of visits to Colleges, members noted the proposal within the report that the Board consider holding up to three of its meetings a year at a College, combining these meetings with a tour and an introduction by the Head of College and/or an opportunity to meet with senior staff. The Board discussed whether it should pursue this approach or whether to continue with separate visits to Colleges, and points were raised in support of both approaches. Professor Freeman-Attwood offered to host a meeting of the Board at the Royal Academy of Music during 2011-12, combined with a visit, and the Board was grateful for the invitation, which it accepted.
- 1397 **AGREED**
- (i) That strategic discussions on the following subjects should be taken forward during 2011-12:
    - (a) The University of London brand;
    - (b) shared services (including the strategy for student services); and
    - (c) Senate House Libraries.
  - (ii) That a strategic discussion on SAS should take place during 2012-13.
  - (iii) That one of the Board's 2011-12 meetings should be held at the Royal Academy of Music and be combined with a visit.

### **Strategic Risks**

- 1398 The Board received a report on the University's high-level risks (BT400). Members noted that there were risks arising from the Vice-Chancellor's announcement that he would stand down at the end of 2011-12, including the possibility that the post might not be filled by August 2012, and that these would be reflected in the next iteration of the Strategic Risk Register. The Chair of the Audit and Risk Committee, Mrs McCarthy, suggested that, in the light of a number of recent senior staff changes at the University, the Strategic Risk Register should be revised to reflect issues relating to succession planning more widely.
- 1399 A query was raised regarding risks to the University posed by the 2012 Olympic Games. It was noted that the locating of the Olympic media centre in

Bloomsbury would result in significant restrictions in access around the area. The Board was informed that discussions between the University and the Bloomsbury Colleges were underway with a view to co-ordinating planning arrangements for this period. A report on contingency planning was due to be considered by the Operational Development Group on 12 October 2011. The Board would be kept informed.

### **Merger of the School of Pharmacy and UCL**

1400 The Board considered a report on the progress of the planned merger of the School of Pharmacy and UCL (BT401). At its previous meeting (BTMM 1296-98 refer), the Board had agreed that it wished to receive further information on the arrangements for students undertaking University awards other than the MPharm (the arrangements for which had already been provided). The information provided by the School of Pharmacy in response to the Board's request, was detailed in the report.

1401 **AGREED**  
That the Board was content with the information received in relation to students at the School of Pharmacy undertaking University of London Awards.

### **Deputy Vice-Chancellor**

1402 The Board received a report on proposed contingency arrangements during the absence of the Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Professor Paul Webley (BT402). Members noted that Professor Webley would be on research leave from the School of Oriental and African Studies until 31 December 2011 and would not be undertaking the role of Deputy Vice-Chancellor during this period.

1403 **AGREED**  
That, in the event of the Vice-Chancellor's unavailability during the autumn term 2011, authority be delegated to the Chief Operating Officer and University Secretary to carry out the responsibilities, and exercise the powers of the Vice-Chancellor in respect of any urgent business.

### **Estates Matters**

1404 The Board considered a report by the Director of Projects proposing the grant of a lease to Kipferl Ltd (BT403).

1405 **AGREED**  
To approve the grant of a lease to Kipferl Ltd for a term of up to five years, and to delegate final approval of the detailed terms to the Vice-Chancellor.

### **Memberships of Committees of the Board of Trustees for the 2011-12 Session**

1406 The Board noted the memberships of its Committees for the 2011-12 session, set out in Document BT404. It was agreed that the Vice-Chancellor should approve appointments to any vacancies at the appropriate time.

1407 **AGREED**

To authorise the Vice-Chancellor to approve, on behalf of the Board, appointments to any vacancies that remained, or that arose during 2011-12.

**Teachers of Anatomy Trust**

1408 The Board received a report (BT405) updating members on changes to the terms of the Trust Deed of the Teachers of Anatomy Trust, and seeking formal approval for the appointments to the advisory committee of the Trust for the year 2011-12. The annual report and statement of accounts for the period to 30 September 2010, were available on the Table at the meeting.

1409 **AGREED**

To approve the appointment of the following officers of the advisory committee of the Teachers of Anatomy Trust for the year from 1 August 2011 to 31 July 2012:

Chairman:	Professor Jon Clarke (King's College London)
Treasurer:	Ms Wendy Birch (UCL)
Vice-Chairman/Secretary:	Professor Vishy Mahadevan (Royal College of Surgeons)

**HEFCE Assessment of Institutional Risk**

1410 The Board received and noted a report on HEFCE's assessment of the accountability, risk and sustainability of the University, based on annual accountability returns submitted in December 2010 (BT406). The letter of 5 July 2011, from the Chief Executive of HEFCE, detailing HEFCE's assessment was attached to the report (Appendix BT406A).

**Senate House Project Phases 2 and 3**

1411 The Board received a report (BT407, Confidential) on the current position regarding the Senate House Project Phases 2 and 3. The report, which included a budget summary for the project, was noted by members.

**The Percival David Foundation**

1412 The Board received and noted a report on developments relating to the Percival David Foundation (BT408, Confidential).

**Report of a Disciplinary Committee**

1413 The Board received and noted a report, tabled at the meeting, on the outcome of a hearing by a Disciplinary Committee held on 5 July 2011 (BT409, Reserved, Confidential).

**Foundation Day 2011**

1414 Members noted a report on Foundation Day 2011 (BT410). Attached at Appendix BT410A were biographies of the 2011 honorary graduands.

### **Action Taken Under Delegated Authority**

1415 The Board noted the action taken under delegated authority since that reported to its previous meeting on 13 July 2011, as detailed in Document BT411.

### **Sealings**

1416 Members received and noted a report from the Vice-Chancellor on sealings of documents (BT412).

### **Dates of Future Meetings**

1417 Members noted the dates of future meetings of the Board as follows (all meetings would commence at 4.00 pm):

#### **2011-12**

Monday, 21 November 2011<sup>2</sup>

Wednesday, 25 January 2012

Wednesday, 28 March 2012

Wednesday, 23 May 2012

Wednesday, 18 July 2012

---

<sup>2</sup> Post meeting note: the start time for the meeting on 21 November 2011 was subsequently changed to 3.00 pm.