



University of London
COLLEGIATE COUNCIL

Friday, 30 April 2010
8.30am
The Court Room, Senate House

MINUTES

PRESENT

Vice-Chancellor (Chairman)	Professor Kopelman (SGUL)
Sir Howard Davies (LSE)	Professor Latchman (Bbk)
Professor Freeman-Attwood (RAM)	Mr P Loughrey (GC)
Professor Gaskell (QMUL)	Dr McDade (HC)
Professor Sir Andrew Haines (LSHTM)	Professor Smith (SoP)
Professor Henderson (CSSD)	Professor Swallow (CIA)
Professor Kain (SAS)	Professor Trainor (KCL)
Professor Kemp (RH)	Professor Webley (SOAS)
Mr R Knight (UCL alternate)	Professor Wiliam (IoE alternate)

APOLOGIES

Professor Grant (UCL)	Professor McKellar (RVC)
Professor Sir Andrew Likierman (LBS)	Professor Rigby (ICR)
	Professor Whitty (IoE)

OBSERVER

Professor Kydd (ES)

IN ATTENDANCE

Mr A Bollington (for CCMM 0599 – 0606)	Ms C Cushion
Mr R Cryer	Mr M Dalton (Secretary)
Professor Crossick (for CCMM 0565 – 0567 and 0588 - 0598)	Ms C Swarbrick

Welcome

- 0561 The Vice-Chancellor welcomed the new Dean of the School of Advanced Study (SAS), Professor Roger Kain, and the new Warden of Goldsmiths, University of London, Mr Pat Loughrey, to their first meeting of the Collegiate Council.
- 0562 The Vice-Chancellor asked that the Minutes record the Collegiate Council's appreciation of the contributions made to previous meetings by the former Acting Dean of the SAS, Professor Edwards, and the former Warden of Goldsmiths, University of London, and Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Professor Crossick.
- 0563 The Vice-Chancellor also welcomed Mr Rex Knight and Professor Dylan Wiliam as the alternates for UCL and the Institute of Education, respectively.

Minutes

0564 The Collegiate Council approved the Minutes of the previous meeting held on 26 February 2010.

Matters Arising

CCM 0525: Heads of Colleges on the Board of Trustees

0565 The Collegiate Council noted that Professor Rigby's term of office as a Head of College on the Board of Trustees would end on 31 July 2010, that Professor Crossick's term had ended with his retirement from Goldsmiths, University of London on 19 April 2010 and that Professor Whitty's term would end with his retirement as Director of the Institute of Education in December 2010.

0566 The Collegiate Council was informed that the Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Professor Crossick, had consulted with Heads of Colleges with a view to recommending to the Collegiate Council three appointments to the Board of Trustees in respect of the above (CCM 0565). Following consultation, it had been agreed to propose that:

- (i) Professor Rigby be reappointed to the Board of Trustees for a two-year term of office from 1 August 2010 to 31 July 2012.
- (ii) Professor Latchman be appointed to the Board of Trustees with immediate effect to 31 July 2013.
- (ii) Professor Kopelman be appointed from 1 January 2011 to 31 July 2014.

APPROVED

0567 The appointment of Heads of Colleges on the Board of Trustees as outlined at CCM 0566 above.

CCM 0526: Representative of the Heads of Colleges on the University of London Union (ULU) Board of Trustees

0568 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC118) by the Secretary on the position of Heads of Colleges' representative on the ULU Board of Trustees. Members were informed that three independent (non-student) Trustees had been appointed to assist the ULU Board and not two as stated in the report. The Collegiate Council noted that Mr Shanley had stepped down from his role as the representative of the Heads of Colleges on the ULU Board of Trustees in March 2010 and that a replacement to fill the vacancy was now required.

CCM 0528: Institute of Cancer Research (ICR)

0569 It was noted that, at its previous meeting, the Collegiate Council had been informed that the ICR had advised the Vice-Chancellor that the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) had indicated orally that it was satisfied with action taken by the Institute in response to the QAA's Institutional Audit Report of June 2008. It had been expected that the audit would be signed off as complete by the QAA Board in March 2010.

AGREED

0570 That the Vice-Chancellor would contact the Chief Executive of the ICR to request information on progress on the signing off of the Institute's audit by the QAA.

CCMM 0532 - 0537: Changing the Name of the External System

0571 The Collegiate Council was informed that, at its meeting on 24 March 2010, the University's Board of Trustees had approved the proposed name changes for the External System. The Dean of the External System reported that the changes would take effect formally from 1 August 2010.

CCMM 0555 – 0557: Higher Education Funding Council for England (HEFCE) Consultation on Revisions to the Financial Memorandum

0572 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC119) by the Secretary on the HEFCE consultation document 2009/46, *Revisions to the Financial Memorandum: consultation on changes to the funding agreement between HEFCE and institutions*, including a copy of the University's response to the consultation attached at Appendix CC119A. It was noted that, as a result of responses received from institutions, the HEFCE was revisiting a number of its suggested amendments to the Financial Memorandum.

Vice-Chancellor's Report

0573 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC120) by the Vice-Chancellor on matters not considered elsewhere on the agenda.

Deputy Vice-Chancellor

0574 The Collegiate Council noted that, following consultation between the Vice-Chancellor and the Vice-Chancellor designate, Professor Crossick, the Board of Trustees had been asked to approve, by correspondence (email), the appointment of Professor Paul Webley, Director and Principal, School of Oriental and African Studies, as the new Deputy Vice-Chancellor of the University. The Board had approved the appointment with effect from 20 April 2010 to 31 July 2013.

QAA Institutional Audit Steering Group

- 0575 The Collegiate Council noted that, at its meeting in December 2009, during discussions on the forthcoming QAA Institutional Audit of the University, a member had commented that the QAA's understanding of the way the federal University operated seemed to be an issue during institutional audits of Colleges also (CCM 0478 refers). The Collegiate Council had agreed that the standard statement on the relationship between Colleges and the University regarding academic matters (Appendix CC120A), last revised by the former Senate in November 2006, should be updated for use by Colleges and the University during QAA visits (CCM 0479 refers).
- 0576 The Vice-Chancellor reported that the QAA Institutional Audit Steering Group, at its meeting on 29 April 2010, had considered a revised standard statement (attached at Appendix CC120B) and agreed to recommend it to the Collegiate Council. The Collegiate Council formally approved the revised standard statement.
- 0577 The Vice-Chancellor reported also that, at its meeting on 29 April 2010, the QAA Institutional Audit Steering Group had discussed the current distinction between intercollegiate examiners and external examiners in the University's academic regulations and procedures. The Steering Group had agreed to consider the matter further at its next meeting.

Capital Investment Framework

- 0578 The Collegiate Council noted that, at its meeting on 26 February 2010, members had expressed a number of concerns in regard to the HEFCE's carbon reduction targets under the proposed second Capital Investment Framework (CIF2) (CCMM 0513 – 0516). Subsequent to the meeting, the Director of Estates and Facilities had contacted the HEFCE, which had advised that, although its aim was for the sector to achieve the Government's targets, it recognised the difficulties many institutions faced due to the nature and location of their estates. Therefore, rather than setting targets, the HEFCE would ask institutions to set their own targets for carbon reduction, which would need to be realistic and justifiable as progress against them would be measured under CIF2. Members of the Collegiate Council commented that this advice seemed to be inconsistent with advice given to Colleges and it was agreed that the Director of Estates and Facilities would provide a report for the next meeting.

AGREED

- 0579 (i) To approve the revised standard statement on the relationship between Colleges and the University regarding academic matters attached at Appendix CC120B.
- (ii) That the Director of Estates and Facilities would provide a report for the next meeting on the carbon reduction targets within CIF2.

CONFIDENTIAL REPORT - Management Accounts to 31 March 2010 and Forecasts for 2009-10

0580 The Collegiate Council received and noted a report (CC121) by the Director of Finance which included the monthly finance report for March 2010 (Appendix CC121A), Management Accounts to 31 March 2010 and Forecasts for 2009-10 (Appendices CC121B and CC121C) and the Group Balance Sheet to 31 March 2010 (Appendix CC121D).

University Subscription and Charges 2010-11

0581 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC122) by the Director of Finance on the University Subscription and Charges for 2010-11, including the proposed Subscription and Charges for 2010-11 (Appendix CC122A). It was noted that, where appropriate, Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) data for 2008-09 had been used in the proposals.

0582 The Collegiate Council noted that the Directors of Finance Working Group had met on 19 February 2010 to consider the proposed federal Subscription for 2010-11. The Working Group had agreed to recommend to the Collegiate Council a reduction in Subscription from £2,230k to £2,015k for 2010-11 as outlined within Appendix CC122A. The allocation of the cost of the Subscription between Colleges included a flat fee element of 25% of the total and an equal weighting of income, and staff and student numbers for the remaining 75% using HESA data.

0583 The proposals regarding Charges for 2010-11, as outlined within Appendix CC122A, had been circulated to the Directors of Finance Working Group on 22 April 2010 by email. The following was noted:

- (i) The proposed Charge for The Careers Group had been endorsed by the Board of The Careers Group at its meeting on 18 March 2010 (the Collegiate Council noted a supporting paper by the Director of The Careers Group attached at Appendix CC122B).
- (ii) The quantum of the Charge for the University of London Research Library Services (ULRLS) reflected costs, including transitional costs, outlined in the report on Extended Option 1A approved by the Collegiate Council at its Extraordinary Meeting on 30 April 2009 (CCMM 0204 – 0243 refer). The allocation of the Charge across Colleges reflected the new formula approved by the Collegiate Council at its meeting on 26 February 2010 (CCMM 0542 – 0549 refer).
- (iii) The Charge for the University of London Union (ULU) comprised the application of an inflation factor to the 2009-10 Charge and constituted the base level of funding in accordance with the report on the review of the role of ULU approved by the Heads

of Colleges Committee, under the previous governance structure, on 18 January 2008 (HOCCMM 529 – 537 refer).

- (iv) The overall Charges for both Examination Services and the Research Degree Examinations Office continued to reduce, although the unit cost per student in respect of the latter would increase from £371 to £428.
- (v) The proposed Charges by the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies (IALS) to the Law Schools had not been presented to the Law Schools Resources Policy Committee and were unavailable.

[Afternote: the proposed Charges were approved by the IALS Resources Policy Committee on 5 May 2010 and forwarded to the Board of Trustees on 26 May 2010]

AGREED

0584 To recommend to the Board of Trustees the proposed Subscription and Charges for 2010-11 as outlined within Appendix CC122A.

Report from the Library Strategic Planning Board

0585 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC123) by the Vice-Chancellor on business conducted at the 25 March 2010 meeting of the Library Strategic Planning Board. The Collegiate Council noted the following appendices:

- (i) ULRSL Strategic Plan 2009-14 – Project Schedule 2010 and 2011 as at 25 March 2010 (CC123A).
- (ii) ULRSL Out-turns for 2008-09, 2009-10 Budget and Quarter 2 Forecast (CC123B).
- (iii) ULRSL 2010-11 Budget Estimates (CC123C).

0586 The Vice-Chancellor drew the Collegiate Council's attention to paragraph nine of the report which stated that, in view of the delays in the Senate House Project, the savings envisaged within Extended Option 1A were unlikely to materialise by 2014. In consequence, a new Strategic Plan, derived from Extended Option 1A, would be drafted as a matter of urgency in order to ensure the financial sustainability of the ULRSL. It was expected that a draft of the revised Strategic Plan would be recommended to the Collegiate Council at its next meeting on 2 July 2010.

0587 The Vice-Chancellor reported that he had held positive discussions with the new Dean of the SAS regarding the School's concerns about the draft service level agreement between the SAS and the ULRSL.

Review of the Development of the Research Strategy at the Central School of Speech and Drama (CSSD)

0588 The Collegiate Council received the Report (CC124) of the Review of the Development of the Research Strategy at the CSSD. At its meeting on 6 November 2009 (CCMM 0427 – 0430 refer), the Collegiate Council had noted that, as part of its review of the most recent applications for membership of the University, the University Council (under the previous governance structure) had agreed two additional provisos when admitting the CSSD in 2005, namely:

‘(a) appropriate conditions should be put in place to require research degrees training and awards to be subject to the involvement of another College; and

(b) there should be a commitment to a review by the Council, after the next Research Assessment Exercise (RAE), of the School’s progress in the implementation of its research strategy generally, and in respect of research degrees in particular, to inform policy in relation to the Central School of Speech and Drama offering research degrees in the future.’

0589 Accordingly, the Collegiate Council had agreed that a small Group should be formed by the Vice-Chancellor to review progress made by the CSSD in the development of its research strategy. Membership of the Group was as follows:

Professor Geoffrey Crossick (Chair)	¹ Deputy Vice-Chancellor; Warden, Goldsmiths, University of London
Professor Jonathan Freeman-Attwood	Principal, Royal Academy of Music
Professor Geoff Ward	Vice-Principal (Planning & Resources), Royal Holloway, University of London (RHUL)
Professor Michael Worton	Vice-Provost (Academic & International), UCL

0590 It was noted that the Group had convened at the CSSD on 22 February 2010 and had met with several senior members of CSSD staff, including the Principal, as part of its discussions. The list of documents considered by the Review Group to aid its deliberations was attached at Appendix CC124A.

0591 Professor Crossick commented that the Group had been cognisant that its remit had not been to make recommendations to the Collegiate Council on the future direction of the CSSD's research strategy. Nor had it been to analyse CSSD's membership of the federal University; rather, as agreed by the University Council, it had been a review of CSSD's progress, since its admission in 2005, regarding: its research degrees training and the

¹ Professor Crossick retired as Deputy Vice-Chancellor and Warden of Goldsmiths College on 19 April 2010.

involvement of another College(s); and the progress of its research strategy generally.

- 0592 At its meeting, the Group had noted the College's results in the 2008 RAE and had concluded that these constituted solid evidence of the CSSD's progress in its research capabilities and achievement since its admission as a College. The Group had commended the Principal, his senior colleagues and all staff at the CSSD on their efforts in this respect.
- 0593 The Collegiate Council noted the various areas which the Group had examined in the course of its discussions, including: CSSD's research degrees training programme (including details of the input of King's College London (KCL) into the development of the programme since 2006); collaboration with Colleges; embedding the research culture; practice-based research; and research-related income.
- 0594 Having considered all the information available to it and with reference to its remit, the Group had been unanimous in its support of the considerable progress made by the CSSD to develop its research strategy and capabilities. The Group had also been content with KCL's involvement in the development of CSSD's research degrees training programme.
- 0595 The Group had strongly endorsed the CSSD's approach to date and had encouraged the following to enhance further the efficacy of the College's research strategy:
- (i) In relation to its PhD and supervisor training, the CSSD may wish to consider enabling its staff to continue to receive training from KCL, or from another College, to benefit from broader perspectives and varied experiences.
 - (ii) The CSSD may wish to consider increasing the number of interdisciplinary activities, both formal and informal, with the Colleges and with the SAS, to augment the cross-fertilisation of concepts and ideas.
 - (iii) The CSSD might benefit by focussing, in the longer term, its research-funding applications on the College's core elements; a more selective and streamlined strategy might generate a greater success rate.
- 0596 The Principal of the CSSD commented that his College had welcomed the Group's review and its conclusions. In particular, the Group's three suggestions outlined in CCM 0595 above were especially helpful.
- 0597 A member of the Collegiate Council noted that the CSSD had expressed the view that a lack of esteemed Principal Investigators (PIs) had been a constraining factor in the generation of research-related income. The member queried whether a career structure existed within the CSSD in order to improve the number of PIs. The Principal of CSSD commented that funding

was a particular problem in the development of such a career structure, but that some progress had been made in this area. Additionally, achieving the correct balance between practice-based research and academic-based research remained an important and challenging issue for the CSSD. It was expected, however, that the research culture within the School would become more refined in future years.

0598 The Collegiate Council commended the CSSD for its progress in developing its research strategy and capabilities. The Vice-Chancellor, on behalf of the Collegiate Council, thanked Professor Crossick and members of the Group for their work on the review.

Architecture for External System Lead College Contracts

0599 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC125) by the Dean of the External System and the Chief Operating Officer of the External System proposing an 'architecture' for drafting of new agreements for the operation of University of London International Programmes (currently programmes of the External System) and a development process leading to the signing of new agreements by all parties.

0600 The Collegiate Council noted that the architecture aimed to ensure high level consistency and equity between College agreements, without specifying high levels of detail (which legitimately needed to vary between programmes). It had been developed following review by the Board of the External System and through an open invitation to Heads of Lead Colleges to respond to an earlier draft. Formal responses had been received from five Colleges and from the Heads of the Law Departments engaged in the Undergraduate Laws Programmes. Feedback received had broadly welcomed the direction of the work, but with two exceptions:

- (i) The Heads of Schools engaged in the Laws programmes had requested that 'throughout the document, the formulation 'Lead College/Consortium' is used'. It was noted that such a formula would give the Undergraduate Laws Programme the status of a Lead College which had potentially serious implications for governance. As a consequence, the Vice-Chancellor would write to the Heads of College of the six Lead Colleges involved to identify the most appropriate way of structuring contracts where there was more than one Lead College.
- (ii) One respondent had requested that the contracts have a fixed duration. It was noted that because of the long notice period required to protect registered student interests (usually five years), it was proposed instead to allow either party to terminate the contract at any time, subject to their commitment to protect the interest of registered students.

0601 Members noted that under the proposed process, the architecture, as approved by the Collegiate Council, would serve as the basis for the

development of new agreements with Lead Colleges, but understood that further consultation and standard commercial negotiations would follow with each Lead College as outlined in paragraphs 10 – 11 of report CC125.

- 0602 A member of the Collegiate Council conveyed concerns of staff within his College who had felt that they had not been given sufficient time to consider the proposals as the consultation period had included the Easter recess. Whilst he supported the concept of an architecture and the process for the completion of new agreements, he expressed concern that the architecture proposed was insufficiently flexible. Neither of the two options available for working with the University of London International Academy, i.e. the service option or the collaborative option, reflected, in full, his College's current relationship with the External System.
- 0603 Another member commented that he had not discussed the proposals in detail within his College and that he would be meeting with the Dean in the week following the meeting. He supported the process outlined but was also of the view that greater flexibility needed to be introduced into the architecture. Another member concurred, suggesting that the two options within the proposed architecture need not be mutually exclusive.
- 0604 Members of the Collegiate Council highlighted the outstanding matter of how Laws programmes might be covered under the architecture (CCM 0600(i) refers). It was felt that this issue too needed to be resolved before the architecture could be endorsed by the Collegiate Council. The Chief Operating Officer and the Dean of the External System both commented that work was already underway to resolve this matter and that a clearer proposal to cover the Laws programmes would be drafted for the Collegiate Council's consideration.
- 0605 The Vice-Chancellor commented that the architecture was a work in progress and that the issues identified by the Collegiate Council would be addressed following the meeting and the architecture considered again at the next meeting.

AGREED

- 0606 (i) That further work should be undertaken on the detail contained within the proposed architecture to address, in particular, the Collegiate Council's concerns outlined at CCMM 0602 – 0604 and that the proposed architecture should be considered again at the next meeting.
- (ii) To endorse the process whereby the approved architecture would serve as the basis for the development of new agreements with Lead Colleges, subject to the understanding that further consultation and standard commercial negotiations would follow with each Lead College as outlined in paragraphs 10 – 11 of report CC125.

Reports from the Central Academic Bodies and Activities

Board of the External System

0607 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC126) by the Vice-Chancellor on business conducted by the Board of the External System at its meeting on 9 March 2010.

APPROVED

0608 The amendments to the External System Strategic Plan as set out in paragraphs 19-20 of report CC126.

Board of the University of London Institute in Paris (ULIP)

0609 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC127) by the Vice-Chancellor on business conducted by the Board of the ULIP at its meeting on 11 March 2010.

0610 It was noted that, at previous meetings, the Collegiate Council had been informed that the Dean of ULIP and the Vice-Principals of RHUL and Queen Mary, University of London, were liaising with a view to finalising a Memorandum of Agreement (MoA) for submission to the governing bodies of the Consortium institutions. The Acting Principal of RHUL commented that his College had not been in a position to approve the document because the Council of RHUL had not wished to commit to the MoA whilst it was undertaking a process of reviewing all its collaborations and partnerships with other institutions - there being no Principal in post had not been the determining factor in RHUL delaying approval of the Agreement.

AGREED

0611 That Mr Miles Denison be appointed to succeed Ms Alice Morton as the student representative on the Board of the ULIP with effect from 1 June 2010 to 31 May 2011.

Board of the School of Advanced Study

0612 The Committee received a report (CC128) by the Vice-Chancellor on business conducted by the Board of the SAS at its meeting on 26 March 2010. Members also received copies of the SAS Annual Report for 2008-09.

APPROVED

0613 The proposal from the Institute of English Studies for a new Master of Research (M.Res) Degree in the History of the Book as outlined at Appendix CC128A.

Board of the University Marine Biological Station, Millport (UMBSM)

- 0614 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC129) by the Vice-Chancellor on business conducted by the Board of the UMBSM at its meeting on 10 March 2010. The Vice-Chancellor reported that an additional meeting of the Board had taken place on 29 April 2010 to discuss the options appraisal for the future of the Station developed by Jura Consultants. The Collegiate Council was informed that, in addition to the four principal options outlined in Jura's report and considered by the Board at its meeting on March 2010, a fifth option, closure of the Station, had been added to the options discussed by the Board at its additional meeting.
- 0615 The Vice-Chancellor reported that the Board had been informed that the University would be unable to invest any further capital in the Station without an anticipated return and that the importance of the ongoing operation and development of the Station to the economy of the Isle of Cumbrae and the Scottish Executive's marine strategy was a matter which the Scottish Government and other related national and local agencies should take into consideration. It was noted that the Board of Trustees would consider the matter further at its meeting on 26 May 2010.

Board of The Careers Group

- 0616 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC130) by the Chairman of the Board of The Careers Group, Professor Latchman, on business conducted by the Board at its meeting on 18 March 2010.

APPROVED

- 0617 The appointment of Mr Stephen Mcauliffe to the Board of The Careers Group with immediate effect to 31 July 2014.

Note CCMM 0618 - 0621 are exempt from disclosure according to the meaning of Part II of the Freedom of Information Act

ULU Financial Performance 2009-10

- 0622 The Collegiate Council noted a report (CC132) by the ULU General Manager on ULU's financial performance for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 March 2010. Members also received copies of the ULU Annual Report for 2008-09.

Review of Effectiveness

- 0623 The Collegiate Council received a report (CC133) by the Secretary on the process agreed by the Board of Trustees for the reviews of effectiveness of the Board of Trustees, the Collegiate Council and the University's Boards and Committees. It was noted that the 2009-10 reviews of effectiveness would follow the same process as that adopted in 2008-09 and that, therefore, members

could expect to receive a questionnaire towards the end of the summer term 2009. Reports on the results of completed questionnaires of the Collegiate Council, and those of its Committees, would be considered by the Collegiate Council in the autumn term of 2010-11 and a report submitted to the Board of Trustees later that term.

Award of Degrees and Diplomas

0624 The Collegiate Council noted a report (CC134) by the Vice-Chancellor on the award of degrees and diplomas.

Dates of Meetings

0625 The Collegiate Council noted the following dates of meetings (all to start at 8.30am):

2009-10

Friday, 2 July 2010

2010-11

Friday, 1 October 2010

Friday, 5 November 2010

Friday, 10 December 2010

Friday, 18 February 2011

Friday, 6 May 2011

Friday, 1 July 2011

2011-12

Friday, 30 September 2011

Friday, 4 November 2011

Friday, 9 December 2011

Friday, 24 February 2012

Friday, 4 May 2012

Friday, 6 July 2012