



University of London
COLLEGIATE COUNCIL

Friday, 1 May 2009
8.30am
STB9, Stewart House

MINUTES

PRESENT	Vice-Chancellor (Chairman) Professor Crossick (Goldsmiths) Sir Howard Davies (LSE) Professor Sir Roderick Floud (SAS) Professor Freeman-Attwood (RAM) Professor Haines (LSHTM) Professor Henderson (CSSD) Professor Kemp (RH) Professor Kopelman (SGUL)	Professor Sir Andrew Likierman (LBS) Dr McDade (Heythrop) Professor Ogden (QMUL) Professor Rigby (ICR) Professor Smith (SoP) Professor Swallow (Courtauld) Professor Trainor (KCL) Professor Webley (SOAS) Professor Whitty (IoE)
APOLOGIES	Professor Grant (UCL) Professor Latchman (Bbk)	Professor McKellar (RVC)
OBSERVER	Professor J Kydd (External System)	
IN ATTENDANCE	Mr R Cryer Ms C Cushion	Mr M Dalton (Secretary) Miss C Swarbrick

Minutes of the Meeting of 20 February 2009

0244 The Collegiate Council approved the Minutes of the meeting held on 20 February 2009.

Matters Arising

Review of Senate House Library

0245 It was noted that, at its Extraordinary Meeting on 30 April 2009, the Collegiate Council had recommended to the Board of Trustees that Extended Option 1A (*Option 1 – Refocusing the ULRLS*) should be adopted, with transitional costs to be met by Colleges.

Joint Appointments Committee

- 0246 It was reported that the Joint Appointments Committee (JAC) had appointed Saxton Bampfyld as 'head-hunters' for the recruitment process for the current Vice-Chancellor's successor. A timetable for the appointment process was currently being drafted for the consideration of the JAC.

Vice-Chancellor's Report

- 0247 The Vice-Chancellor reported on matters contained within his report (**CC039**) and not included elsewhere on the agenda.

Senate House Project

- 0248 Members were informed that the Senate House Project remained within budget and on schedule. The Vice-Chancellor commented that the reconfiguration of space had facilitated the creation of state-of-the art teaching rooms and modern conference facilities.

Quality Assurance Agency

- 0249 The Vice-Chancellor informed the Collegiate Council that the University of London was scheduled for an Institutional Audit by the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) in the spring of 2011 and not autumn 2011 as stated in his report. Under the University's new governance structure, the Collegiate Council would be responsible for the direction of the preparations for the Institutional Audit.
- 0250 The Vice-Chancellor commented that the critical issue during the previous Institutional Audit in 2005 had been the University's collective exercise of, and accountability for, its degree awarding powers. Therefore, it was a matter which affected all Colleges of the University, the School of Advanced Study (SAS) and the External System. Whilst representations had been made to the QAA during the previous Institutional Audit to the effect that its methodology was inappropriate for the federal University's structure and operations, the QAA had not been persuaded. As a result, it was essential that the University articulated a complete, coherent and collective view on its quality assurance philosophy and operations in the light of the governance arrangements implemented in August 2008 as another outcome of 'limited confidence' could have serious implications.

AGREED

- 0251 That a QAA Institutional Audit Steering Group, to include a Head of College and a SAS representative, would be established to undertake the necessary analysis and subsequently formulate the draft self-evaluation document, reporting regularly to the Collegiate Council.

London Business School

0252 It was noted that the Vice-Chancellor, on 18 March 2009, had advised the Collegiate Council by email that the QAA Institutional Audit of the London Business School (LBS) had been published on the QAA website on 19 December 2008. The QAA Institutional Audit team had identified many important areas of good practice, notably in terms of how the LBS engaged with students in obtaining feedback, the quality of information available to students, the use of alumni in recruitment processes, the work of the programme offices in supporting students, and the quality and timeliness of feedback provided to students.

0253 However, the report had also identified one area where the QAA had 'limited confidence' in the LBS's procedures. A complaint had been lodged with the QAA in September 2008 challenging this conclusion, but the complaint had not been upheld. In parallel, the LBS also put in place all the necessary changes to its procedures to address the key concerns, and these new procedures were firmly in place. The QAA's report included a brief statement from the LBS outlining the steps initially taken and being taken in response to the audit.

0254 The Vice-Chancellor reported that he had received a detailed statement from the LBS, as a result of which he had noted the position and indicated to the Dean of the LBS that he was content with the actions of the School.

Strategic Planning

0255 It was noted that the draft Strategic Plan 2009-14 would be reviewed by the Strategic Planning Working Group on 7 May 2009 before being considered by a Joint Meeting of the Collegiate Council and the Board of Trustees on 20 May 2009.

Membership of the Board of Trustees

0256 It was noted that Professor Hill had stepped down as the Principal of Royal Holloway, University of London. The Deputy Vice-Chancellor was consulting amongst the Collegiate Council members with regard to Professor Hill's replacement on the Board of Trustees and a recommendation would be made in due course.

Royal Holloway St Georges

0257 The Vice-Chancellor reported on progress with the proposed merger between Royal Holloway, University of London, and St George's, University of London. A Project Company, RHSG, had been established and incorporated to oversee the merger process. The Company Board was being chaired by the Vice-Chancellor and its first meeting had been held on 23 March 2009. The Vice-Chancellor stated that he would resign as Chairman of the Board should any conflict of interest arise. A Project Director had been appointed and the development of an academic strategy was well advanced.

Collegiate Council Alternates

0258 The Vice-Chancellor reported that Ordinance 5, Clause 3, which allowed for Collegiate Council alternates, had been drafted in 2008 following detailed discussion at the Constitutional Review Working Group (CRWG). The CRWG had envisaged that it would be in exceptional circumstances only that Collegiate Council members would send an alternate e.g. illness or sabbatical leave.

AGREED

0259 That the Vice-Chancellor, in liaison with the Deputy Vice-Chancellor, would draft a protocol to cover circumstances under which alternates could attend meetings of the Collegiate Council.

University Subscription and Charges 2009-10

0260 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Deputy Director of Finance on the University Subscription and Charges for 2009-10 (**CC040**). Members were advised that, as had been agreed at the previous meeting, a Working Group of College Directors of Finance had reviewed the proposals in respect of the Federal Subscription and Charges to apply during 2009-10. The proposals for the Subscription and Charges 2009-10 contained at Appendix **CC040D** had been recommended to the Collegiate Council by the Working Group of College Directors of Finance.

0261 The Collegiate Council noted that the proposed overall Subscription and Charges for 2009-10 (excluding Charges by the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies (IALS) to the Law Schools) totalled £7,809k, which was a reduction of 7.5% from the 2008-09 total of £8,440k.

0262 With regard to the proposed Subscription for 2009-10 of £2,230k, this constituted a decrease of 2.7% on the 2008-09 Subscription of £2,293k. It was noted that the formula for the allocation had changed to a flat fee for 25% of the Subscription (from the 12.5% flat fee in 2008-09) with the remaining 75% calculated at a *pro rata* rate based on a combination of Colleges' income and student numbers. The Collegiate Council was advised that the proposed allocation across Colleges was indicative only as the *pro rata* component had been calculated using Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) student data for 2006-07. The allocation would be updated on the receipt of 2007-08 HESA student data.

0263 Several Collegiate Council members from small and/or specialist Colleges expressed disquiet about the increase in their Subscription levels resulting from the move to a flat rate allocation for 25% of the Subscription. It was noted, however, that this was a principle agreed by the Heads of Colleges Committee in January 2007 and that 25% was the upper limit, after which any suggestion of a further increase would require negotiations amongst members of the Collegiate Council.

- 0264 The proposed Charges for 2009-10 (excluding IALS Charges) of £5,579k constituted a 9.2% decrease on the equivalent 2008-09 Charges of £6,147k. However, it was noted that the proposed Charges for 2009-10 excluded the ULRIS transitional charge of £888k under the Extended Option 1A which had been recommended to the Board of Trustees (CCM0245 above refers).
- 0265 The Collegiate Council expressed concern at the inconvenience caused to Colleges' budgetary processes from the omission of the IALS Charges to Laws Schools. It was agreed that the Dean of the SAS should pursue this matter and request that the IALS ensure its future proposals for Charges are synchronised with the University's timetable for the setting of Charges.
- 0266 The Director of Finance reported that as a result of the review of the Charges for Examination Services for 2008-09 which had been undertaken during 2008-09 (CCM 010, 3 October 2008 refers), several Colleges would be receiving a share of a total rebate of £202k.
- 0267 A member of the Collegiate Council expressed concern that the costs to Colleges using the Research Degrees Office had increased considerably following the withdrawal of a number of Colleges from the service (3 Colleges had withdrawn in 2007-08 and another 3 in 2008-09). It was reported that a proposal had been put to the Research Degrees Committee (RDC) that the service should cease to be offered, but that representatives of Colleges using the service on the RDC had requested that the service should continue as it remained a more cost effective option than Colleges establishing and operating an equivalent service 'in house'. A member of the Collegiate Council suggested that Colleges might wish to establish collaborative arrangements in such instances.
- 0268 The Dean of SAS expressed concern that reductions in central services would increase the financial pressures on the School. Not only would the School need to establish its own research degrees office in the event that the University's Office ceased to exist, but reductions in University services also increased the central charges to all other remaining divisions. The Vice-Chancellor commented that the University was seeking to maximise its revenue streams from the refurbished Senate House in order to keep central charges as low as possible.

AGREED

- 0269 To recommend to the Board of Trustees the proposed Subscription and Charges for 2009-10 (Appendix **CC040D**), subject to the addition of the ULRIS transitional charge of £888k agreed by the Collegiate Council at its Extraordinary Meeting on 30 April 2009.

Finance Report – Management Accounts for the six months ended 31 January 2009

- 0270 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Director of Finance on the University's income and expenditure account for the six months ended 31 January 2009 (**CC041**). Members were advised that the Report had been received by the Board of Trustees at its meeting on 25 March 2009. The Board of Trustees had also received a report containing background information on the past and current financial position of the University, as well as details of the Finance Action Plan which had been adopted to achieve a turnaround to surplus. Updated estimates of income and expenditure for 2008-09 and a draft budget for 2009-10 would be considered by the Board of Trustees at its meeting on 13 May 2009.
- 0271 The Collegiate Council was informed that the Board of Trustees had expressed concern about the £3.2M deficit over the period 1 August 2008 to 31 January 2009, an adverse variance of £0.3M against the budgeted deficit of £2.9M. A slight improvement since the 31 January 2009 position was reported, but an operating deficit in line with the budget of £4.5M remained the likely out-turn for 2008-09. The Finance Action Plan had outlined a series of measures in order to reduce this operating deficit to ca. £2M in 2009-10 and achieve a small surplus in 2010-11.

AGREED

- 0272 That copies of the reports entitled The Financial Position and Finance Action Plan received by the Board of Trustees at its meeting on 25 March 2009 be circulated to members of the Collegiate Council.

Reports from Central Academic Bodies and Activities

Board of the External System

- 0273 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor, as Chairman of the Board of the External System (BES), on issues discussed by the BES at its meeting on 17 March 2009 (**CC042**).
- 0274 A member of the Collegiate Council enquired about the high level of investment (£4.9M from External System reserves) required for the Business Transformation Project. The Collegiate Council was informed that lengthy and detailed discussions had taken place at meetings of the External System Finance Committee and BES, before the total budget for the Project (£8.1M) had been approved by the Board of Trustees on 25 March 2009.
- 0275 The Dean of the External System informed members that a completely new system was necessary to replace the now outmoded ATLAS system. In consequence, the market leading SITS student information system had been purchased in view of the complex nature of the project – the External System collaborated with 13 Colleges each with differing requirements for their

respective programmes. Therefore, the standard SITS package would need to be tailored to meet the particular needs of the External System. Added to these costs were those of seconding six staff from the External and Internal Student Administration (EISA) Division to work full time on the Project. It was reported that a robust investment appraisal to accompany the Project proposal had been presented to the Board of Trustees and this had demonstrated a relatively short payback period of 7 years.

- 0276 A member of the Collegiate Council expressed concern at the poor quality of the Financial Review of the External System by PricewaterhouseCoopers. He was also concerned that External System income could not be reconciled with the University's new finance system, UniFi21. The Collegiate Council was informed that there had been problems with the interface between the EARS and ATLAS systems used by the External System and UniFi21 but that these difficulties had been substantially resolved.

Board of the University of London Institute in Paris

- 0277 The Collegiate Council received and noted a report by the Vice-Chancellor, as Chairman of the Board of the University of London Institute in Paris, on issues discussed by the Board at its meeting on 12 March 2009 (**CC043**).

Board of the School of Advanced Study

- 0278 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor, as Chairman of the Board of the School of Advanced Study, on issues discussed by the Board at its meeting on 20 March 2009 (**CC044**). The Dean of SAS commented that implementation of the Higher Education Funding Council for England (HEFCE) Review Implementation Action Plan, in response to the HEFCE Review of 2007, was expected to be completed by the end of summer 2009. He also reported that a first draft of the four-year strategic plan would be considered at a Directorate meeting on 1 May 2009 and that good progress had been made with regard to central charges and service level agreements with the University.

- 0279 The Collegiate Council was informed that a new Director had been appointed to the Institute of Musical Research. Professor John Irving, Professor of Music History and Practice Performance, University of Bristol, would take up post on 1 August 2009 for five years on a secondment basis.

Board of the Careers Group

- 0280 The Collegiate Council received and noted a report by Professor Latchman, as Chairman of the Board of the Careers Group, on issues discussed by the Board at its meeting on 19 March 2009 (**CC045**).

Board of the University Marine Biological Station, Millport

- 0281 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor, as Chairman of the Board of the University Marine Biological Station, Millport, on business

conducted at the Board's meeting on 11 March 2009 (**CC046**). The Vice-Chancellor reported that discussions had been initiated with a consortium of schools about the possibility of it signing a lease for the *RV Aora* and thereby assuming the running costs of the research vessel. It was also reported that both the Highlands and Islands Enterprise and the North Ayrshire Council had expressed significant intent with regard to preserving the Station in view of its importance to the Isle of Cumbrae – it was estimated that approximately 40% of the island's economy was related to the Station.

Academic Trust Funds

- 0282 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor containing proposals for the future of University Prizes and the Central Research Fund (**CC047**). It was noted that the Academic Trust Funds Committee (ATFC) had recommended that University Prizes and Awards, with the exception of the Julian Corbett Prize, should cease to be offered forthwith. The ATFC had concluded that, in view of the recent changes in the provision of degree programmes and University governance, the concept of a University Prize no longer remained appropriate. It had recommended that the consequent income released from the Scholarship Fund should be added to the funds available for research grants normally distributed through the Central Research Fund.
- 0283 However, in accordance with University policy, it had been recommended to the ATFC that, subject to the views of the Charity Commission, research grants should cease to be made through the Central Research Fund mechanism from the end of the 2008-09 session and, instead, the funds be allocated to Colleges for award through their own mechanisms and procedures. It was noted that it would not be possible to transfer the capital amounts to each College due to the terms of the trust deeds which constituted the University as trustee.
- 0284 The Collegiate Council was informed that there had been a steadily increasing demand for the available funds and that the difficulties anticipated in making awards due to the recent abolition of the category Teacher of the University, and thus in defining eligibility for awards, would make the exercise increasingly unviable. The Collegiate Council agreed that for the purposes of the recommendation, 'Colleges' should be taken to include the SAS.

AGREED

- 0285 (i) That the prizes and awards listed in Appendix **CC047A**, other than the Julian Corbett Prize, should cease to be offered forthwith.
- (ii) That responsibility for the award of the Julian Corbett Prize be devolved to the School of Advanced Study.
- (iii) That, subject to the views of the Charity Commission, research grants cease to be made through the Central Research Fund mechanism from the end of the 2008-09 session and the funds be allocated to Colleges

(which includes the SAS) for award through their own mechanisms and procedures in accordance with the purposes of the Scholarship Fund.

Review of Effectiveness

0286 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Secretary to the Board of Trustees, which outlined the process for the review of effectiveness of the Board, Collegiate Council and University Committees (**CC048**). It was noted that a standard questionnaire, which formed the basis of the review, would be circulated to Collegiate Council members at the end of the summer term 2009. The Collegiate Council would consider reports on the results of its own completed questionnaires, together with the results of the reviews of its Committees, at the end of the autumn term 2009.

London Science and Creativity Park

0288 The Collegiate Council received and noted a report (**CC050**) by the Vice-Chancellor on progress towards the establishment of the London Science and Creativity Park (LSCP) which included Internal Drawings and Visualisation of the LSCP (Appendix **CC050A**) and a map of the area of the LSCP (Appendix **CC050B**).

University of London Union Financial Performance for the period August 2008 to January 2009

0289 The Collegiate Council received a report on the financial performance of the University of London Union (ULU) for the period August 2008 to January 2009 by the ULU General Manager (**CC051**). It was noted that ULU had returned a surplus of £219k for the period against a budgeted surplus of £98k and that the predicted year-end surplus had increased to £174k.

CONFIDENTIAL REPORT - Examination Offences

0290 The Collegiate Council received and noted a report by the Head of the Academic Office on decisions taken under the Regulations for Proceedings in respect of Examination Offences by Candidates for University Awards from March 2008 to February 2009 (**CC052**)

Award of Degrees and Diplomas

0291 The Collegiate Council received and noted a report by the Head of the Academic Office on the award of degrees and diplomas (**CC053**).

Dates of Meetings

0292 It was noted that the final meeting for the 2008-09 session would take place on Friday, 3 July 2009 at 8.30am.

0293 The following dates of meetings for 2009-10 were noted:
Friday, 2 October 2009

Friday, 6 November 2009
Friday, 11 December 2009
Friday, 26 February 2010
Friday, 30 April 2010
Friday, 2 July 2010

Note The following Minute is exempt from disclosure according to the meaning of Part II of the Freedom of Information Act

CCM 0287