



University of London
COLLEGIATE COUNCIL

Friday, 6 November 2009
8.30am
The Court Room, Senate House

MINUTES

PRESENT

Vice-Chancellor (Chairman)	Dr McDade (Heythrop)
Professor Crossick (Goldsmiths)	Professor McKellar (RVC)
Professor Edwards (SAS)	Professor Ogden (QMUL Alternate)
Professor Freeman-Attwood (RAM)	Professor Rigby (ICR)
Professor Grant (UCL)	Ms D Scully (CSSD Alternate)
Professor Sir Andrew Haines (LSHTM)	Professor Swallow (Courtauld)
Professor Kopelman (SGUL)	Professor Trainor (KCL)
Professor Latchman (Bbk)	Professor Webley (SOAS)
Professor Sir Andrew Likierman (LBS)	Professor Whitty (IoE)

APOLOGIES

Sir Howard Davies (LSE)	Professor Kemp (Royal Holloway)
Professor Gaskell (QMUL)	Professor Smith (SoP)
Professor Henderson (CSSD)	

OBSERVER

Professor Kydd (ES)

IN ATTENDANCE

Mr R Cryer	Mr M Dalton (Secretary)
Ms C Cushion	Ms C Swarbrick

Welcome

0412 The Vice-Chancellor welcomed Professor Ogden (Queen Mary, University of London) and Ms D Scully (Central School of Speech and Drama) (CSSD) both of whom were alternates for their respective Head of College.

Minutes

0413 The Collegiate Council approved the Minutes of the previous meeting held on 2 October 2009.

Matters Arising

Joint Appointments Committee

0414 It was reported that a short list of candidates for the successor to the current Vice-Chancellor had been completed and that interviews would take place on 16 November 2009. A recommendation would be made to the Board of Trustees at its meeting on 1 December 2009.

Vice-Chancellor's Report

0415 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor on matters not considered elsewhere on the agenda (**CC082**).

Dean of the School of Advanced Study (SAS)

0416 It was reported that Professor Roger Kain had been appointed as the new Dean of the SAS. Professor Kain was currently Deputy Vice-Chancellor for Research and Knowledge Transfer at the University of Exeter, as well as Treasurer and a Vice-President of the British Academy. Professor Kain would take up his post on 1 April 2010.

Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) Institutional Audit Steering Group

0417 It was reported that the Steering Group had held its first meeting on 26 October 2009 which included a presentation on the QAA Audit Methodology by the QAA Deputy Director (Audit). Following the presentation, the Steering Group had discussed how to proceed in its coming meetings and agreed to recommend to the Collegiate Council some minor amendments to Regulation 1, University of London Awards, Section D, Academic Standards and Quality Assurance, as follows:

'QUALITY ASSURANCE

67. Each College shall put in place academic quality assurance procedures, which shall have regard to the provisions of the Quality Assurance Agency's *Academic Infrastructure*, and which shall be approved in accordance with arrangements made by its governing body.

68. The Collegiate Council will be responsible for the approval of appropriate academic quality assurance procedures for degree programmes organised on a federal basis and for degree, diploma and certificate programmes offered at the University of London Institute in Paris; the School of Advanced Study; and under the External System. These procedures shall have regard to the provisions of the Quality Assurance Agency's *Academic Infrastructure*.

69. A College shall provide annually unless otherwise specified, to the Collegiate Council:

....

69.5 dates scheduled for visits by the Quality Assurance Agency, reports and communications received ~~during the year~~ from the Quality Assurance Agency following its reviews and the College's response(s) to these (to be provided as soon as available);...

Library Strategic Planning Board (LSPB)

0418 It was reported that the University of London Research Library Services (ULRLS) Project Manager, Elizabeth Powis, had started in post and was providing weekly progress reports to the Vice-Chancellor. Additionally, a meeting had been held with the Director of the Institute of Historical Research

(IHR) who had recognised the need to move expeditiously. Accordingly, the Director had agreed to establish an internal project group (which included the Project Manager) to take forward relevant restructuring in the IHR. A report of discussions at the 26 November 2009 meeting of the LSPB would be made to the Collegiate Council at its next meeting.

SAS Visiting Professorship

0419 The Collegiate Council received a proposal for a Visiting Professorship within the SAS to be sponsored by the NZ/UK Link Foundation (Appendix **CC082A**). The proposal had been considered by the Board of SAS at its meeting of 27 October 2009. The Board had agreed to recommend the proposal to the Collegiate Council on the basis that it would be fully funded by the Foundation and that the SAS would not incur additional costs. It was expected that the first Visiting Professor would be selected by March 2010 and start in post in October 2010. The Master of Birkbeck endorsed the proposal and commented that recent external discussions concerning the future of Birkbeck's Centre for New Zealand Studies had also supported such a bipartite initiative.

APPROVED

- 0420 (i) Amendments to Regulation 1, University of London Awards, Section D, Academic Standards and Quality Assurance, as set out at CCM 0417 above.
- (ii) The proposal for a Visiting Professorship within the SAS to be sponsored by the NZ/UK Link Foundation as set out in Appendix **CC082A**.

Admission of New Colleges

0421 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor on the Admission of New Colleges (**CC083**).

University Assets

0422 Members noted that the University's solicitor, Pinsent Masons, had been asked for advice on the Collegiate Council's query at its previous meeting about the entitlement of a new College to a share of the University's assets. Pinsent Masons' advice was attached at Appendix **CC083A** and, in particular, the following was noted:

'The Board of Trustees therefore applies the University's assets for the University's (charitable) purposes. These include serving and supporting the interests of the Colleges. As long as the University continues to exist and function, its assets are its own to be applied in accordance with the direction of the Board of Trustees. Accordingly, a departing College would not be entitled to take any part of the University's assets with it, unless it had a specific claim – e.g. by contract, or if particular assets were held on a specific trust for that College.

It would only be on a dissolution of the University that the question of the destination of the University's assets would arise.'

0423 The Vice-Chancellor informed the Collegiate Council that the principles outlined in Pinsent Masons' advice above had been applied when Imperial College left the University in 2007. In particular, endowments set up before 2007 for which the trust deed stipulated that income should be applied for the benefit of Imperial College students specifically had been transferred to the College on its departure. Similarly, Imperial had relinquished the right to any claim upon other endowments for which trust deeds stipulated that income would be applied for the benefit of University of London students.

0424 With regard to the distribution of assets upon dissolution, the Collegiate Council noted that Pinsent Masons had advised that:

'In the event of a dissolution of the University, its assets would be dealt with in the same way as those of any other charitable institution. The assets would be applied to charitable purposes as close as possible to the University's. In reality this would be highly likely to involve at least some of the Colleges. However, the Colleges generally would not (apart from any specific contractual or other claims of the kind mentioned above) have any direct legal interest in or claim on the University's assets.

It would be for the Board of Trustees in accordance with the Statutes which would be responsible for determining how the assets should be distributed among the Colleges.

If the Board of Trustees was unable to agree or reach a decision on the distribution of the assets, it would be for the Charity Commission, or the court, to make a scheme for the application of the University's assets.'

0425 A member of the Collegiate Council asked, as the University was incorporated under Royal Charter, had Pinsent Masons considered whether dissolution might be by Act of Parliament which could affect the distribution of assets. It was agreed that further advice would be sought on this matter.

0426 A member of the Collegiate Council enquired about Pinsent Masons' advice that 'the Colleges are not part of the University constitutionally or legally' and that the 'relationship between the University and the Colleges is principally contractual'. It was noted that the Constitutional Review Working Group which had drafted the current Statutes and Ordinances had outlined the University's duality within the Statutes: (1) the University as a separate legal identity from that of the Colleges and whose Board of Trustees acted as the guardian of the assets; and (2) the University as part of a federation, together with Colleges. The latter had been included to ensure there would be no subordination of Colleges to the University i.e. Colleges were separate legal entities with their own governing body, independent of the University. It was noted that the assets of the University had become distinct from those of the Colleges with the passing of the University of London Act 1994, which had altered the relationship between Colleges and the University. Guardianship of the assets was now the responsibility of the Board of Trustees following the University's governance changes in 2008.

Review of Most Recent Applications for Membership of the University

- 0427 The Collegiate Council was informed that, following the previous meeting, a review of the processes for the admission of the five most recent Colleges of the University had been undertaken. The review had incorporated the applications by London Business School (1996); Royal Academy of Music (1999); Courtauld Institute of Art (2002); Institute of Cancer Research (2003); and Central School of Speech and Drama (2005).
- 0428 The Collegiate Council noted details of the review as outlined at paragraphs 4 – 28 of Document **CC083** and agreed that the *Strategic Policy, Criteria and Process for the Admission of New Colleges* (Appendix **CC083D**) as considered by members at the previous meeting should be amended to ensure that any application by an institution for admission as a College of the University should be accompanied by a written resolution of the institution's governing body.
- 0429 Members noted that the University Council had agreed an additional proviso when admitting the CSSD in 2005. As the CSSD had been at an early stage of its research development strategy, the Council had agreed to a review of the CSSD's research strategy following the Research Assessment Exercise of 2008. The Collegiate Council agreed that a small group should be formed by the Vice-Chancellor to review progress made by the CSSD.

AGREED

- 0430 (i) That Pinsent Masons should be asked for further advice on the possibility of a distribution of assets being facilitated through an Act of Parliament (CCM 0425 above refers).
- (ii) To recommend to the Board of Trustees the *Strategic Policy, Criteria and Process for the Admission of New Colleges* (Appendix **CC083D**), subject to the amendment outlined at CCM 0428 above.
- (iii) That a small group would be formed on behalf of the Collegiate Council to review information received from the CSSD on the development of its research strategy.

London Business School – Exercise of Degree-Awarding Powers

- 0431 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Secretary to the Board of Trustees (**CC084**) on an application by the London Business School (LBS) for the exercise of its degree-awarding powers (Appendix **CC084A**). The Vice-Chancellor reported that all the necessary assurances had been received from the LBS.
- 0432 It was noted that, under Ordinance 9, Clauses 9.1 – 9.7, all Colleges exercising degree-awarding powers were required to provide an annual report containing details of a number of academic and quality assurance related

matters. Colleges which already exercised degree-awarding powers had been submitting reports annually. These were considered by the Quality Practitioners' Forum which then reported to the Collegiate Council.

APPROVED

0433 The exercise of degree-awarding powers by the LBS from February 2010.

Note Minutes CC 0434 – 0440 are exempt from disclosure according to the meaning of Part II of the Freedom of Information Act

Honorary Degrees

0441 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Vice-Chancellor on two matters relating to Honorary Degrees (**CC086**). It was noted that on 1 October 2009, the Vice-Chancellor had written to the Collegiate Council by email requesting that Mr Nicholas Hytner, Director of the National Theatre since 2003, should be invited to receive the degree of Doctor of Literature *honoris causa* at the 2009 Foundation Day Ceremony. A majority of respondents to the Vice-Chancellor's email had been in favour of inviting Mr Hytner to receive an Honorary Degree.

0442 The Collegiate Council noted that all members of the working group which had considered and made recommendations on nominees to be awarded Honorary Degrees at the 2009 Foundation Day Ceremony had agreed to continue to serve on the working group to consider and make recommendations on nominees for the 2010 Foundation Day Ceremony.

AGREED

- 0443 (i) That, in accordance with Ordinance 4(2.11) and Regulation 2, Mr Nicholas Hytner should be awarded a Doctor of Literature *honoris causa* at the 2009 Foundation Day Ceremony.
- (ii) To re-establish the 2009 Foundation Day working group of Heads of Colleges to consider Honorary Degree nominations for the 2010 Foundation Day ceremony for recommendation to the Collegiate Council.

Review of Effectiveness of the Committees of the Collegiate Council

0444 The Collegiate Council received a report by the Secretary on the Review of Effectiveness of the Committees of the Collegiate Council (**CC087**) including the questionnaire results of the review of the effectiveness of the committees of the Collegiate Council (Appendix **CC087B**).

0445 Whilst there had been a clear majority of positive responses to questions by committee members, the Vice-Chancellor drew the Collegiate Council's attention to three recurring issues:

- (i) being kept informed of material matters between meetings;
- (ii) new members being provided with sufficient induction; and
- (iii) being aware of, and having, opportunities to attend formal courses, conferences etc.

0446 It was noted that the Central Secretariat had been consulting with senior officers with regards to populating an 'induction portal' on Quorum (the University's online repository for committee papers) for new members of committees to access useful background information. The irregularity of relevant courses or conferences was also noted. However, senior officers would ensure that members were informed of opportunities to attend relevant courses and conferences.

0447 The Collegiate Council noted that there had been a mixed response during discussions at committee meetings regarding being informed of material matters between meetings. For example, the Board of SAS had indicated at its meeting on 27 October 2009 that it did not wish to receive additional papers but, instead, would prefer access to the SAS intranet. The Vice-Chancellor commented that, for many committees, there were few material issues which arose between meetings. However, there were instances when senior officers had raised material matters with committee members between meetings. A recent example cited was the ongoing dispute between the University and the Warburg Institute over the interpretation of the 1944 Trust Deed enacted when the Warburg collections were passed to the University. Developments on this matter continued to be communicated to members of the Board of Trustees between meetings.

Note Minutes ESFC 0448 – 0450 are exempt from disclosure according to the meaning of Part II of the Freedom of Information Act

University Annual Report 2008-09

0451 The Collegiate Council received the draft University Annual Report for 2008-09 (**CC088**).

APPROVED

0452 The University Annual Report for 2008-09.

University of London Union (ULU) Financial Performance 2009-10

0453 The Collegiate Council noted a report on the ULU financial performance for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 October 2009 (**CC089**).

Award of Degrees and Diplomas

0454 The Collegiate Council noted a report on the award of degrees and diplomas (CC090).

Dates of Meetings 2009-10

0455 The Collegiate Council noted the following dates of meeting for 2009-10:
Friday, 11 December 2009
Friday, 26 February 2010
Friday, 30 April 2010
Friday, 2 July 2010