

Jonathan Wolff

Term 1 2001-2002

Dept of Philosophy

j.wolff@ucl.ac.uk

University College London

Office hour Monday 11.30 to 1.00

## THE MARKET AND JUSTICE

‘Emphasis on the responsibility of the individual for his own fate [has been] replaced by emphasis on the individual as a pawn buffeted by forces beyond his control.’ Milton and Rose Friedman, *Free to Choose* Penguin 1980, p.23.

### **Aims and Objectives**

The lectures will address the following questions:

What is the free market?

What are the theoretical alternatives to the free market?

What economic systems do we actually have in the world?

How is the choice between different economic systems to be made?

It is assumed that the answer to the last of these questions is that the choice between economic systems is to be made on the basis of the values that they promote or impede. We will assess various possible systems on the basis of their contribution to efficiency, freedom, justice and community. We will consider the possibility that there is a tension between what is desirable from the point of view of the human being as producer and the point of view of the human being as consumer.

## **Lecture Outline**

1. 15th November: The Free Market; its Forms and Alternatives
2. 22nd November: Arguments from Efficiency
3. 29th November: Arguments from Freedom
4. 6th December: Arguments from Justice
5. 13th December: Arguments from Community. Conclusion

## **General Readings**

Extracts from some of the readings below are reprinted in Michael Rosen and Jonathan Wolff (ed) *Political Thought* (OUP 1999) This is referred to as R&W.

Although there are many works which bear on these issues, the best introduction is Allen Buchanan, *Ethics Efficiency and the Market*, 1985. In the UK it is published only in hardback (OUP), but in the US there is also a paperback edition (Rowman and Allanheld). In theory it is still in print in the US and may be available from internet bookstores.

John O'Neill, *The Market: Ethics Knowledge and Politics* (Routledge 1998) also covers much of the ground of these lectures, but is somewhat more specialised, focusing particularly on a critical assessment of Hayek. However it is one of the few works which contains any discussion of 'associational socialism', and even here it is briefer than one would like.

F.A. von Hayek's own views are expressed over many works, the most important of which are *The Constitution of Liberty*, and *Law, Liberty, and Legislation*. Perhaps the best introduction to his work is Chapters 3 and 8 of his *The Road to Serfdom*(1944)(for a short extract see pp 238-240 R&W). The whole of this classic work is still worth reading.

Alec Nove, *The Economics of Feasible Socialism* (2nd Edition 1991) is a superb mix of theoretical and empirical arguments, arguing from the standpoint of someone very sympathetic to socialism, that planning an entire economy cannot work. The first edition has been said to have had an influence in the transformation of Eastern European economies.

For a very brief introduction to the issues see Jonathan Wolff *An Introduction to Political Philosophy* (OUP 1996) pp. 158-167.

Many of the relevant works of Marx, Engels and Lenin are extracted in the Progress Press volume *Marx, Engels, Lenin On Communist Society*. All the works of Marx and Engels referred to here are available on [www.marxists.org](http://www.marxists.org) Generally, see in particular *Manifesto of the Communist Party*, and *Critique of the Gotha Programme*.

### **Arguments from Efficiency**

Allen Buchanan, *Ethics, Efficiency and the Market*, Chapter 2

Frederick Engels, *Socialism: Utopian and Scientific* extract R&W pp380-382

Fredrick Engels, *Speeches in Elberfeld* Marx and Engels *Collected Works* Vol 4

Fredrick Engels, Principles of Communism Marx and Engels Collected Works Vol 6

F.A. von Hayek, Law, Liberty, and Legislation extract R&W pp 216-8,  
The Road to Serfdom extract R&W pp238-41

John O'Neill, The Market, Chapters 3, 4 and 10-12.

Adam Smith The Wealth of Nations extract R&W pp214-5.

Alec Nove, The Economics of Feasible Socialism

Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State, and Utopia, Ch 8 pp 250-53

### **Arguments from Freedom**

Allen Buchanan, Ethics, Efficiency and the Market pp 78-80, 95-100

G.A. Cohen, 'Justice, Freedom and Market Transactions', in his Self-Ownership, Freedom and Equality. Extract R&W pp222-223.

Milton Friedman R&W pp. 85-6: From Free to Choose. See also  
Capitalism and Freedom

Karl Marx, Alienated Labour, from 1844 Manuscripts

Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State, and Utopia, Ch 8 pp 246-50, 268-271.

John O'Neill, The Market, Chs 5-8.

Jonathan Wolff, 'Playthings of Alien Forces; An Introduction to Marx's Theory of Alienation', Cogito, Spring 1992., also in Reading Political Philosophy ed. N. Warburton, J. Pike. and D. Matravers

### **Arguments from Justice**

Allen Buchanan, Ethics, Efficiency and the Market pp 49-94.

Allen Buchanan, A., 'Exploitation, Alienation and Injustice', Canadian Journal of Philosophy 9, (1979), pp. 121-39.

Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State, and Utopia, Ch 7, Section I, pp 149-164.

R.H. Tawney, The Acquisitive Society, extract R&W 208-210.

### **Arguments from Community**

Elizabeth Anderson, Value in Ethics and Economics

Allen Buchanan, Ethics, Efficiency and the Market pp 101-103.

Richard Cobden, 'England, Ireland and America', in The Political Writings of Richard Cobden. Extract R&W pp. 260-263.

Karl Marx, On Money from 1844 Manuscripts extract R&W pp 202-6.

Margaret Radin, Contested Commodities

Michael Walzer, Spheres of Justice

### **Non-Capitalist Markets**

Allen Buchanan, Ethics, Efficiency and the Market pp 104-107.

Joseph Carens, Moral Incentives and the Market

Ronald Dworkin, 'Equality of Resources', in his Sovereign Virtue, and Philosophy and Public Affairs 1991 248-254. Extract R&W 248-254.

David Miller, Market, State, and Community